

The Doctoral Students' Council The Graduate School and University Center The City University of New York 365 Fifth Avenue, Room 5495 New York, NY 10016-4309 T: 212.817.7888 E: dsc@cunydsc.org W: http://cunydsc.org

Plenary MINUTES April 15th, 2016

Dianami	Present : Ryan Abrahams, Yuval Abrams, Khalid Al Hilli, Jimiane Ashe, Chloe Asselin, Lisa Babel, Cassandra Barnes, Kyla Bender-Baird, Carol Brathwaite, Sharmaine Browne, Shelley Buchbinder,
Plenary	Carlos Camacho, Rachel Chapman, Pablo Crespo, Ernesto Cuba, Erin Cully, Chloe Edmondson, Rebecca Fullan, Kishore Gangangari, Ernesto Garcia, Dean Gibson Schafer, Eleanor Goldman, Drew
Executive Committee	Green, Richard Gustavson, Anna Harb, Michael Healy, Lauren Hudson, Philip Johnson, Stefanie
Steering Committee	Jones, Joshua Katz-Rosene, Sean Kennedy, Mawia Khogali, Grace Kim-Lambert, Theodor Maghrak, Velina Manolova, Elizabeth Martignetti, Amy Martin, Melissa Marturano, Erin McKinney-Prupis, Jeremiah McMillan, Jason Nielsen, Dominique Nisperos, Teresa Ober, Rajat Kumar Pal, Helen
Constitution and Bylaws	Panagiotopoulos, Alison Park, Lindsay Parme, Jennifer Peirce, Ana Perry, Brooke Prashker, Jen Prince, Jeremy Randall, Jacob Russell, China Sajadian, Saiful Saleem, Rebecca Salois, Cecilia Salvi,
Grants	Cosim Sayid, Liza Shapiro, Gwen Shaw, Hamad Sindhi, Corinna Singleman, Cihan Tekay, Charlotte
Health & Wellness	Thurston, Stephanie Vella, Deepti Wadhera, Janet Werther, Tellisia Williams, Jessica Woodson, Allan Zelener
Outreach	Absent: Fabiana Alceste, Elaine Chang Sandoval, Jennifer Chmielewski, William Lorenzo, Rachel
Student Services	Weintraub, Alexander Wood
USS Advisory Committee	Amy Martin (AM) calls the meeting to order at 4:35pm.
Advocate Advisory Board	I. Approval of Agenda
	1. AM proposes to unanimously approve the agenda, unless there are any objections.
OpenCUNY Board	2. Jennifer Pierce (JP) moves to table New Business item number 3 (Resolution
Governance Task Force	Endorsing a Boycott of Israeli Academic Institutions) to a future meeting, Cosim Sayid (CoS) seconds.
EDLAB	i. JP: it is a procedural issue, there was no other forum to discuss this and there was no consensus in her program on the issue and felt they could not
Student Tech Fee	take a position, felt they did not have time to consider the issue sufficiently,
	rather than debate here, would like to table and structure a dialogue that
	would ultimately be in the service of social justice issues brought up in the resolution.
	ii. Sean Kennedy (SK): as one of the GC students for the boycott and one of the
	resolution writers, objects to the delay, the resolution writers have not had a
	chance to present the resolution to the body, and in 2014 earlier version of
	this started lots of dialogue, this one took into account the exchanges and
	dialogues from that time, we have the information we need, we can look at



other associations who have passed this, NYU is holding a referendum soon as well, there was also a pooling of resources.

- iii. Dominique Nisperos (DN): we have passed resolutions with shorter time frame so I see this as a stalling tactic, also used for other issues, like police brutality, etc., we are deep thinkers, trust that constituents were talked to, Googling was done, and it is not fair to delay discussions.
- iv. Yuval Abrams (YA): we have debated this topic before, but this is a different resolution, there is new language and if people feel they aren't informed, if people want to discuss with the larger student body we should allow that opportunity, since we haven't had a Town Hall the way that institutions like NYU have.
- v. Cihan Tekay (CiT) moves to call the question, Jeremy Randall (JR) seconds.
- vi. AM clarifies we need 51 (2/3rd majority) people in favor to end debate. Motion passes with 59 yeas, 5 nays, and 3 abstentions.
- vii. AM clarifies we will now vote on the previous motion to table NB 3. Motion fails to pass with 19 yeas, 44 nays, 3 abstentions.
- viii. CoS: Point of information Do we plan to end discussion before speaker comes? AM clarifies that she will propose to limit discussion to 5:45pm during discussion on New Business item 3.
- 3. AM moves to approve the agenda, Hamad Sindhi (HS) seconds. Motion passes with 63 yeas, 1 nay, and 2 abstentions.
- II. Approval of Minutes of March 18, 2016
 - 1. AM proposes to approve minutes by unanimous consent, unless there are any objections. No objections were noted. Minutes approved unanimously.
- III. New Business
 - 1. New member ratification
 - Jennifer Prince (JPr) moves to ratify new members Lindsay Parme (LP) for at-large representative, Carol Brathwaite (CB) for MALS program representative, and Grace Kim-Lambert (GKL) for at-large representative, Tellisia Williams (TW) seconds. Motion passes with 60 yeas, and 2 abstentions.
 - 2. Constitution & Bylaws changes
 - IPr moves to make proposed changes to constitution language for Articles IV.1.1, III.3.4, III.3.5, III.3.9, VII.1 and 2, III.2.3 (see addendum to minutes), HS seconds. Motion passes with 61 yeas, and 2 abstentions.
 - ii. JPr moves to table bylaws changes, HS seconds.
 - 1. CoS: why are you thinking about tabling it? JPr clarifies that it's because new information from the Alumni and Fundraising



Coordinator that is relevant to the bylaw has come to light and we want another month to sort this out.

- 2. Motion passes with 63 yeas, and 2 abstentions.
- 3. Resolution Supporting the Boycott of Israeli Academic Institutions
 - i. HS moves to adopt the resolution, DN seconds.
 - 1. SK: do writers of the resolution get a chance to present it?
 - 2. AM: clarifies that he can present it during his turn to speak.
 - 3. Abigail Lapin (AL), proxy for Gwen Shaw (GS): this matter is something close to my heart so I will read something I prepared: spoke about anti-Semitism she experienced in Paris, and that she had to hide her Jewish identity, cited incidents in Central African Republic, ISIS attacks, and Paris terrorist attacks, stressed that the resolution does not take into account both sides of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, noted that Israeli academic institutions are where conversations about the conflict are happening, pointed out that this resolution is unlike the resolutions DSC passed on Vietnam and India because it singles out Israel for attack, is nervous that she will have to hide her identity and pass as atheist again at the GC, and notes this resolution makes her uncomfortable.
 - 4. SK: this resolution is a response of a call from Palestinians to the world to speak to their issues, there has been a lot of discussion on this at the GC in the last couple of years, BDS is being discussed at NYU next week, reads statement from friend Mahmoud, which states that after almost 70 years of attempts to push the Palestinians from the region, there is a push to get Israel to abide by International Law, the BDS movement has been powerful in shedding light on the issues that Israeli academia has done to students in the region, this is a major step towards a movement of solidarity globally.
 - 5. CiT: rejects notions of anti-Semitism, this boycott is a call from 2004 and comes out of calls from Palestinian academics, want the academic institutions in Israel to be boycotted until the country abides by international law, there has been work done to avoid harming individual Israeli academics, wants academic freedom for Israeli academics, adopting the UN definition of academic freedom, there are obligations that come with those rights, these have been violated in Israel and Palestine, as someone from Turkey where 4 academics are imprisoned is open to boycotting Turkey, and anyplace where a call for boycott comes from the indigenous people of the land.
 - 6. JP: has been involved with similar issues in student government, standing in opposition not to language but to process and how social justice issues are addressed by the DSC, got a broad mix of opinions



and a lot of people didn't have knowledge of the issues, concerns about implications of this resolution in practical terms, questions if a boycott is a good tactic and there was no discussion of this as tactic.

- 7. JR: as one of the writers wants to speak to issues of boycott and academic freedom, CUNY bans travel to NC and MS due to anti-LGBTQ laws, this is less restrictive, academics can come from and go to Israel, this resolution is taking a stand for academic freedom of Palestinians which has been violated, unlike the hypothetical violation of Israeli academics.
- 8. Jimiane Ashe (JA): did a Google poll with Biology program students, have two questions for writers of resolution from Bio students, many of the resources shared with the resolution seem dated (8 years old), very current primary resources are important, why those resources? Second, why this boycott over other boycotts in the US or abroad?
 - a. SK responds: international call for boycott from Palestinian academics was in 2004, that's why some of the documents go back 8 years, there are also more recent documents including AP's boycott to give a range of sources, why this boycott? Because the call was made from Palestinians, and part of the reason we brought it up here is because the US backs Israel.
- 9. Saiful Saleem (SS): anti-Semitism in France must be strongly condemned, but for the most part people in the BDS-movement are not motivated by anti-Semitism, some of them are Jewish and some are even Israeli Jews, has concern that this resolution targets indiscriminately all Israeli universities, understands the urgency of showing solidarity in the current climate, but not sure that we're targeting the right people with this boycott, would like to see a resolution that targets specific centers, institutes, and departments that have proven and direct links to the military apparatus and the ongoing occupation.
- 10. Janet Werther (JW): has prepared a statement, wants to pass as written, this is addressing structural oppression not individual acts, if you agree to stopping systemic oppression you should vote yea, there is a conflation of anti-Zionism and anti-Semitism and as activists who are the future of academia we must clarify those distinctions, we are obliged to stand up for Palestinians, if we as New Yorkers we want to respond to a presidential candidate who speaks vehemently with hateful Islamophobic rhetoric then this is something for us as New Yorkers to vote for.
- 11. Yuval Abrams (YA): I want to speak against, we have discussed what universities can do, what is the role and responsibilities of the DSC, question of boycott as tactic, what is impact on CUNY, you should not see this as a good idea after hearing these points, academic freedom



is an issue here, PACBI (Palestinian Campaign for the Academic and Cultural Boycott of Israel) has revised their statements because their initial boycott harmed individual academics, there is no academic boycott that does not infringe on freedoms, AAA (American Anthropological Association) wants to block database from being accessed in Israel, Israeli academics coming to conferences on their own money and having to hide their institutional alliance, AAU (Association of American Universities), AAUP (American Association of University Professors), UFS (University Faculty Senate) have consistently opposed institution boycotts, where is institutional solidarity in this boycott? What we should be doing is being in solidarity with individuals whose rights have been hurt, this blames universities for the crimes of the state, I would not support one for Turkey, Saudi Arabia, etc., would like to see conferences and more discussion with the same people from various universities, we should allow both here and want to encourage more conversations and not less, it's not the DSC who will solve this problem, it's people in Israel and Palestine, PACBI is planning to boycott conference on water crisis in Gaza at Hebrew University, do not succumb to nationalist forces, DSC is the voice and concern of the students, there should not be a privileging of certain voices and not others, there has been a petition from students and faculty begging DSC not to pass this with 600 votes, passing it here binds this institution to that cause and it is offensive and insulting, when you pass it even if it were misguided you can talk to us without binding it to us, if it did have teeth and if we and CUNY did pass it, it would hurt this institution, former Physics CUNY GC chair asked Yuval to pass this on: I would resign before staying at CUNY if CUNY passed this.

- 12. AM proposes to unanimously limit debate to 2.5 minutes for every speaker, if there are no objections.
 - a. CoS objects, and moves to limit debate to 6:15pm with a maximum of 10 minutes per speaker as per Robert's Rules of Order, YA seconds.
 - i. David Nagy (DaN) proxying for Anna Harb: think 10 minutes is too long.
 - ii. HS: expresses concern about Shabbat, observant students may have to leave at 6:15pm.
 - iii. CiT moves to amend motion to 2.5 minutes per speaker, DN seconds.
 - 1. Discussion on limiting time to 2.5 minutes per speaker.
 - 2. Motion passes with 59 yeas, 4 nays, and 5 abstentions.



- b. CoS modifies his original motion to limit debate to 6:20pm, but withdraws modification after others comment on students who need to leave for religious practices.
- c. Motion passes with 57 yeas, 3 nays, and 3 abstentions.
- 13. Brooke Prashker (BP): we focus on social justice as public health, wants to talk about academic boycotts specifically, academic boycotts subvert academic freedom and flow of academic ideas, this boycott is a threat to academic freedom and we should defend academic freedom, academics often dissent and that is not where the troubles are coming from, if you do not want an academic boycott, vote no, if you are not sure or feel uninformed, you can abstain.
- 14. Erin McKinney-Prupis (EMP): did study abroad in Israel with Arab Israelis and Jewish Israelis, these universities represent coexistence and boycott is not a solution.
- 15. Dean Schaefer (DS): reads statement from student in program, an MA student remaining anonymous because of fear of how it will affect job prospects, as citizen of Israel and a committed anti-Zionist Jew who wants to support this boycott, have witnessed tacit and overt support for military from academic institutions, do not want to hurt people because of some vague conversation on academic freedom that seems to be deployed only in certain situations, a yes vote will not stop this conversation but will hopefully help better Israeli institutions.
- 16. Sheehan Moore (SM), proxying for Kishore Gangangari (KG): required to abstain by person he is proxying for, but supports resolution, as member of Adjunct Project which has endorsed this resolution, as we see boycott as labor, and this is an act of solidarity, also reads statement from Jewish Voice for Peace on militarization in Israel.
- 17. TW: gives up her space to speak because her suggestion to limit time has already passed as a motion.
- 18. Velina Manolova (VM): reads statement from a Palestinian student at the Graduate Center, which talks about being banned to enter occupied Palestine, resolution is work of a movement of Palestinians, and we should answer their call, urges to endorse resolution as Americans and students.
- 19. HS: wants to read statement from Christina Nadler, a student in his program, which talks about history not having any right sides, struggling with and for power, Israeli history already being written, but need to intervene and help speak and write Palestinian history, academic freedom as about producing words but also being heard, Palestinians not being heard and so need academic freedom as well.



- 20. DaN: wants to discuss dialogue, dialogue has never ended a conflict, groups with power give up power when forced to, this is a symbolic resolution that brings this pressure to Israel, that pressure and not dialogue can end occupation in Palestine
- 21. CoS: being asked to vote on this resolution but we're not talking about it, Edward Said writes on Orientalism, and we are orientalizing Palestinians as homogenous who think and do the same, treating Palestinians and Israelis as monolithic in their view, as if they all came together to decide on this, PACBI brought up by CiT, PACBI says conversation with group of musicians containing Israelis and Palestinians promotes dialogue and that's not allowed to happen under the boycott, critiques JR who says he stands with Milliken, the guy who hasn't gotten contract in six years? With Cuomo?
- 22. DN: people of color don't have true equality even in this room, freedom is not real, power is, and we should think about being complicit in an institution where the president questions the existence of structural racism, this resolution is about people who will never be at a university, whose voices will never be heard, think of how you fit in this institution and have power, have a vote here today and it matters even if we can't talk to all our constituents.
- 23. Jacob Russell-Madonia (JRM): the Math program is unanimously against this resolution, thinks back to Cold War, when academics couldn't discuss across the Iron Curtain and could not advance the discipline, many would be against the State or terrorism but as academics we must support academics.
- 24. Erik Wallenberg (EW) proxying for Chloe Asselin (CA): I'm part of group that brought original resolution, have brought countless events each year during that time, has been discussed in the Advocate, this is about raising the discussion of Palestinian oppression, their academic freedom being infringed there, our students are being attacked for speaking out against US and Israeli issues, UFT (United Federation of Teachers) does not back BDS, can help push back against that by passing it here, UMASS passed resolution on BDS, must connect it to the struggle of apartheid in South Africa.
- 25. China Sadajian (CSN): Reads statement from AAA site in favor of boycott from Palestinian and Israeli academics, which talks about the Israeli high court underfunding BDS groups, that BDS targets states, companies and institutions to protect individuals, Palestinians are not passive victims, boycotts are one way for Palestinians to fight back.
- 26. Melissa Marturano (MM): notes academics have responsibility to speak against oppression and Israel has often turned to academic



institutions for support of their regime including that not one Israeli institution condemned war in Gaza, more people are concerned with Israeli academic freedom but not the Palestinians who are not protected and who do not have rights given the occupation, there is one side who can maintain the regime, power differential is vast.

- a. YA has a quick response to MM's statement that "not one university condemned war in Gaza": they do not make political statements as academic institutions, people may cite the Electronic Intifada and say they did support war on Gaza, but that is not true, institutions should not take political stances, including ours.
- ii. AM ends debate as per previous motion (see 12.a), and calls the question.Motion passes with 42 yeas, 18 nays, and 9 abstentions.

AM calls for a 15-minute recess and asks representatives to come back at 6:30pm.

Terrence F. Martell (TM), University Faculty Senate Chair:

TM presented an academic freedom of expression agreement from the University of Chicago.

Questions:

JW: In conversation with the debate we just had, it's clear that questions about academic freedom can be used differentially given the power and value of different individuals. Often there is vague speaking about freedom of expression: can you speak specifically about a couple of campuses, Hunter included, of what you are talking about?

TM: There is an investigation of claims of anti-Semitism at the university, whether true or not true, right or wrong, is for independent sources to investigate, wherever your view is on any issue, discussion you had is not my business, whatever happens to one group can just as easily happen to another group, always have to be careful, have to be careful about slippery slope that you chose to slide down, I have a great deal of concern that discussion about money to CUNY, Republican's reasons for not supporting a \$485 million to senior colleges has to do with antisemitism, we live in a political world, this is a public institution, I am concerned that if we don't take a strong stand on these issues we will end up unhappy in the long term, I leave it to your judgment to make an assessment of how important this is, a strong statement about freedom of expression is helpful as we try to maintain the kind of intellectual life we want to have here at CUNY.

DaN: I quickly went over the text, and personally I didn't find anything in particular that I disagree with, what incidence is this supposed to be aimed at? We agree with democracy and rights but my question is why in particular are we reaffirming our commitment to freedom of speech?

TM: External pressures on different sides of the spectrum to ban organizations that currently exist, doesn't want to get into details.

JW: But what are the details?



TM: You don't need them, its freedom of expression.

JW: We do, because these expressions are being used to curtail academic freedom of people who have taken stand against apartheid and BDS.

TM: I think it's appropriate for you to read and decide if you agree or disagree as a body.

TM: Other things I want to mention: Governor announced last week that Thompson will be the new --if we gets approved--chairman of the board, replacing Ben O'Schmidt whose term has expired over two years ago, 5 new replacements on that board--need to be aware that change is taking place, we don't know what promises were made to get that position, if we keep appointing people like these first two, we will be fine, a major shakeup of the board is happening as we speak, will not affect lives we lead but could affect budgets, and capital projects, last thing: role of faculty governance, shared governance has improved remarkably in the last few years, chancellor is much more faculty-centric, much more willing to engage and ask questions of the faculty, the tone at the top has changed, which influences tone across the organization, seeing a chancellor who is much easier to interact and exchange ideas, what else do you care about? You know about the budget, less than great but better than some other university systems across the country, 2% cut here as well as at other senior colleges, could be worse even if it's not what we want.

AM: Is Governor's appointment of him to the board, after letting seats go un-renewed and over, directly linked?

TM: Thompson came from Yale, etc., came with nice credentials, I understand why he wasn't replaced, all of a sudden there's a heightened level of activity, could be good to have him here, because appointees are known to governor, so when they pick up the phone and call the second floor of the capitol building, they might get treated better generally than when I picked up the phone and make that call, double-edged sword, we don't know how he will turn out, Thompson has an MPA from Baruch, wife is on the fund board for Lehman, Thompson's father went to Brooklyn College and graduated, sons and daughters of CUNY alums often go other places, so he went to Tufts, but he went there because his father went to Brooklyn, could be wrong about him but I am hopeful about him.

DN: What about faculty senate initiatives around diversity, people of color?

TM: Electing senators?

DN: No, faculty at CUNY.

TM: Nothing to do with CUNY culture.

DN: Something you can work on, think about?

TM: Currently it's not an issue we deal with because campus decisions made at campus, and each has their own faculty senate. Those orgs deal with specifics on campus; mine deal with campus wide issues.

DN: I understand, but still worth doing at a CUNY level.



Sharmaine Browne (SB): 3 more appointees to be made?

TM: Yes.

SB: Process by which this happens?

TM: behind closed doors--behind the door is another door.

SB: Why July 1st?

TM: Terms end June 30, three trustees will have terms expired, wouldn't be surprised is Governor named three replacements.

TM: Wonderful meeting with democracy in action.

Dadland Maye (DM) proxying for Jessica Woodson (JW): Implement internships as credits on campuses?

TM: Experiential learning, I was on that task force, the concern I had was that there'd be a requirement for internship, we fought to get that language changed in legislation, original language had that requirement in there, we fought to make it optional, first, experiential faculty workload issues when credit bearing, and whether something that should be part of a curriculum should belong to faculty and not Governor, putting another requirement for graduation, then there's another impediment to graduation.

TM: Thank you all, good luck with your careers!

AM calls the meeting back to order at 7:10pm, and to continue with New Business items.

AM calls a quorum count.

III. New Business (cont.)

- 4. Resolution on Tuition Remission
 - i. JPr moves to pass a resolution expanding tuition remission for Graduate Center Students, DN seconds.
 - 1. DaN: quickly explain given I'm a proxy.
 - a. JPr: explains the work of Ad Hoc Committee on Tuition Remission and the "Be it resolved" part of the resolution.
 - 2. JP: asks about Criminal Justice's part-time students.
 - a. JPr: website will speak to stories beyond full-time students, part-time folks included if they're adjuncts.
 - 3. Sunil Philip (SP) proxying for Richard Gustavson (RG): MFE at Baruch promises students getting money after grad.
 - 4. JRM: this is about tuition remission for work or tuition fellowships from department.



- a. JPr: we are calling for CUNY Central to extend support past the 11th to the 16th semesters whether by fellowships or waivers
- 5. Michael Murphy (MMu) proxying for Corinna Singleman (CrS): asks about school's budget planning.
 - a. JPr: Budget is planned with student enrollment projections, but this is about asking CUNY Central to give more money rather than the GC.
- ii. AM calls the vote. Motion passes with 51 yeas, and one abstention.
- 5. Vote on Hunter Alliances of Cross-Disciplinary Sciences (HACS)
 - i. AM explains org and moves to approve the org, Cecilia Salvi (CS) seconds.
 - ii. Motion passes with 51 yeas, and one abstention.
- 6. Presentation of GC Student Association for LIS Inequality Research
 - i. Ian Haberman (IH): wants to start org to help people access LIS data on income and wealth, and explains the rationale behind making this a chartered org.
 - ii. DN: questions about why student funded.
 - 1. IH: Students do not have access to the data, Gornick probably does not want to fund.
 - 2. DN follows up: Have you asked?
 - 3. IH: Trainings and general support are not offered, will have Gmail listerv.
 - iii. Jen Tang (JT) proxying for TW: can the data be made open instead of helping people get in?
 - 1. IH: Wish we didn't need this system, to get the data access has taken years and they do not let you get too much into the data, we want to use the info in the data but want to respect confidentiality, scholars can access it but cannot go too deep.
 - 2. JT follows up: will you advocate or not for open access?
 - 3. IH: Fought for this and want to continue to fight for open data, we the students support open data.
 - iv. Darren Kwong (DK) proxying for Kyla Bender-Baird (KBB): why just for LIS and not more open to social science data in general?
 - 1. IH: This was born from people struggling to use LIS but it does not have to be that way, we want support to other groups as best we can, often must marry other data to this data and we can help as best we can to do that.
 - 2. DK follows up: have you considered a DSC or archive grant, if so why not? Have you talked to digital humanities?



- 3. IH: Did not know about grant and will look into those as a possible alternative, have not reached out to digital humanities but will, my guess is that they don't work with LIS and that is what we provide.
- v. Dadland Maye (DM): expresses he is not sold on the idea, there is no specific intervention made here, uncomfortable with it being closed off and inaccessibility, especially if we are using student funds to do it, perhaps there is another route, have you spoken to other chartered orgs?
 - IH: Data itself is protected but available for public use, want to open it more by helping with the registration process, requires time and we don't want others wasting time to find their access points because we can help you with the process of accessing this data.
 - 2. DM: rephrases question about alternative monies.
 - 3. IH: wanted to see recurring funds to see ongoing activities, see an ongoing lecture series with interdisciplinary scholars, when I leave I want other people to have that continued flow of information, looked at mission statements of other groups and did not see specific mission re: community and access to the data.
 - 4. DM: have you pursued collaborating with other chartered orgs?
 - 5. IH: Would love to collaborate with student groups and it helps everybody for us to all work together, will take initiative to do that.
- vi. JA: regarding discussion of limitations of access to data, explains how these limitations work, human beings are protected similar to HIPPA or IRB; that's the access to data people are not getting.
- vii. AM reminds us about standards for approving chartered orgs, and that body will be asked to vote on this chartered org at the next meeting.
- 7. Presentation of Constitution & Bylaws Changes
 - i. JPr moves to table because we don't have slides to present on this, TW seconds. Motion passes with 42 yaes, and one abstention.
- 8. Presentation of the 2016-2017 budget
 - i. JPr discusses budget and differences from current year.
 - ii. JRM: asks about raising student fees.
 - 1. JPr: we were not able to get needed 10% petition signatures to send this to a referendum vote.
- IV. Executive Committee Reports
 - 1. Co-Chair for Student Affairs (Amy Martin)
 - i. Vote for next year's DSC representatives
 - ii. Will send email to nominate students to Grad Council Committees. Do not need to be on Grad Council to serve on these committees



- iii. Remind constituents about the two open positions with OpenCUNY and the Adjunct Project
- 2. Co-Chair for Communications (Hamad Sindhi)
 - EC meeting with President Robinson, March 30th 2016: update on new i. provost appointment - said that he wants to wrap this up before Spring Break, so maybe expect an announcement in a few weeks, tuition remission pressed him on the importance of this for students; he asked us to send estimates to Provost Lennihan; emphasized that they are thinking of creating programs like 'master teachers' or other fellowships that would include tuition remission and sell our teaching expertise to CUNY Central and possibly get more money per course, but only for 20 or so students; office for Disability Services - plan stalled due to 9th floor renovation, no date still on implementation; we pressed about getting at least a web-page up that would describe the services that are already being implemented; Diversity initiatives - Dean (but might not be a dean, could also be a 'special advisor') would be someone from the faculty already, and not completely a new line in terms of compensation, but it's on hold because of other budgetary constraints (because they don't think of this as a core budgetary matter already); hesitant about program standing committees on diversity. health care for Masters students: less enthusiastic about this because of high premiums, but will look into it; we pressed about how this could increase diversity if offered to incoming Masters students.
 - ii. EC meeting with VP Becca Kornfeld (BK), April 1st 2016: BK is meeting with State and City Council Reps to talk about CUNY/funding, BK's goal this year is to develop a strategic communications plan, discussed profiling everyday life of GC students as part of outreach campaign, among other outreach strategies, discussed access to business cards and GC letterhead for GC students, discussed development of GC website.
 - Meeting with Phyllis Schulz, Director of Office of Financial Aid, April 8th 2016: Tuition remission: 2 different types of tuition waivers: ones that come with fellowships, ones that come with adjunct teaching, 90 students had tuition covered by Graduate Center through the dissertation fellowships, if student works more than 10 semesters consecutively at the same CUNY campus, that campus can cover some tuition (depends on the campus), Bursars Office has the actual data on who is paying tuition, caps on grants/loans: a student can have up to \$40,000 in total stipends (including assistantships and summer fellowships), once you apply for federal aid, federal guidelines state that students cannot have financial aid that exceeds their attendance (tuition and fees + cost of living which is \$23,914, unless living with a parent in which case its 9,914), assistantships do not go toward cap, summer fellowships do not go toward federal cap; borrowing federal loans has decreased from last year, 493 (bulk are doctoral students,



especially from Audiology, Social Welfare, Public Health, Physical Therapy and the sciences) borrowers in 2016-17, average borrowing is \$15,000, 15 students did private loans (which can be tricky) and Phyllis' office will reach out to private borrowers that federal loans are also available, PH will have its own financial aid office next year, Communications: in late summer, send word out on signing up for work-study, many slots available, working on a Commons page to address common questions (link this with the DSC site when available), students can apply starting now for FAFSA, direct loan, and other federal aid, govt. sun setting Perkins but it will be available to students who received Perkins in the past and file FAFSA early next year only, emergency funds:

- \$250 in 2 days if do not have any financial aid
- \$500 if student has financial aid
- delay in loan payment due to administrative problems: school can give an advance (but will take it out once the disbursement comes in)
- same as above for stipend checks
- advances during One-Stop for new students (cuz their first paychecks are always delayed)
- 3. Co-Chair for Business (Jennifer Prince)
 - Receipt deadlines: Grants: May 25th; Program Allocations: June 1st;
 Chartered Organizations: June 8^{th.} Remember: receipts should be turned in, taped on 8.5 x 11" paper, with node ID recorded
 - ii. Mission: Tuition Remission
 - 1. Ad Hoc Committee on Tuition Remission met and planned our new website
 - 2. Although the DSC has passed this resolution, we ask that you also cosign it individually by leaving a comment on the site
 - 3. We will be periodically publishing stories from our survey
 - 4. Coming soon: Twitter, Facebook, and digital sign campaigns #TuitionRemission
 - 5. Students enrolled in semester 11+: Audiology: 10; DMA: 21; DNS: 3; DPH: 39; PhD: 1156
- 4. USS Delegate (Cecilia Salvi)
 - i. Board of Trustees: Board Meeting 3/21; Next meeting 5/2
 - 1. The Graduate School of Public Health and Health Policy: changes to the University Center of the GSUC's Governance Plan have been approved unanimously.
 - 2. The BoT unanimously approved the City College of New York and York College proposed Academic Excellence Fee of \$800 per semester, effective Fall 2016.
 - 3. Several other schools have established Doctorates (Lehman, Baruch) and Master's Programs (Hunter, City, John Jay and SPS).



- ii. Board of Trustees: Fiscal Affairs Committee 4/4
 - We voted on a Predictive Analytical Software System to be implemented for undergrad programs at the Senior Colleges in Fall 2016. I voted against, along with Trustee Beal; Trustee Clarke abstained.
 - 2. Report was issued by Matt Sapienza VC Budget and Finance
 - 3. This information was shared with all students in the all-student email
- iii. USS
 - 1. Plenary will be held on 4/17
 - 2. Changes to the Scholarship Application will be voted on (credit limits).
- iv. Committees
 - 1. Governance Task Force: Met on 3/21. Out-of-date governance documents: We discussed the history of the changes to the Sociology Program Governance Document, and the student advocacy to update it. Students have decided to go through the Structure Committee. We also discussed what happens with items (gov documents, committees, etc.) when students put in the work, and then EOs step in and take over. Rebecca updated us on the status of the HLBLL document and student attempts to update it.
 - 2. Building Awareness of Program Governance: We came up with different media campaigns, including an *Advocate* ad, the 3,5, 8th floor windows and screens, and posters.
 - 3. Program Governance Grades: CS and Sean Kennedy will review the information from a previous survey (2014) and decide how much is useable. Then, they will move forward with an awareness campaign on student involvement in program governance.
 - 4. USS Scholarship Committee: Met on 3/21. We discussed changing the language and requirements to the Scholarship Application for year, including reducing the letters of rec from 2 to 1; credit limit changes for both grads and undergrads; we also discussed how to increase the number of applicants, and how we will determine winners. Finally, we discussed April 18th is the hard deadline for SLDs to send the applications to COSA. Last year, there were 180 applications, 115 complete applications, and 85 winners.
 - 5. There are 9 applications from the GC this year.
- v. Etcetera
 - 1. The budget proposal for ARC (\$3000) for the Diversity Conference, which will tentatively be held May 12-14, was accepted. I followed up with Robotham on 3/23 and 3/30.
 - 2. CCSD: The co-chairs wrote a letter to get a meeting with VC Brian Cohen and once there is a response. At that meeting, we will



advocate for off-campus Assistive Technology for GC students. Once we move forward, I will work on a budget proposal. The Ad-Hoc Committee on Disabilities Services provided me with data on what students need.

- 5. UFS Liaison (Liza Shapiro)
 - i. Last UFS plenary on the 29th with Chancellor Milliken, discussed Albany budget
 - 1. Spoke about the ZOA's letter and Senate holding back funding from CUNY on alleged anti-Semitism charges brought up against SJP. Said he's taking freedom of speech issue seriously and making a working group to examine this.
 - Questions raised about Sarah Schulman from CSI being asked to testify before the CUNY task force on anti-Semitism. VC Rick Schaefer responded that Prof. volunteered to testify and was not asked. Members of UFS suggested that those who want more realistic information should go to Schulman's website to know what's going on.
 - 3. Milliken was asked about students receiving metrocards from City Council for undergraduates. He said Guttman students were funded for metrocards but all undergrads cannot be because it would cost CUNY \$31.3 million.
 - ii. Resolution affirming University of Chicago's Report on Freedom of Expression
 - 1. UFS passed resolution affirming the University of Chicago Report on Freedom of Expression on Campus (with four abstentions).
 - 2. Senators expressed concern that non-tenured faculty not as free as tenured faculty on campus.
 - iii. Update on budget
 - 1. No provision to cover TAP gap. Costs about \$49 million for senior colleges.
 - 2. All three budgets (executive, senate, and assembly) included \$16.6 million in fringe costs (but still falls short of actual cost is \$29 million).
 - iv. Governance
 - 1. Board Committee on Faculty Staff and Administration recently passed two new governance plans. School of Medicine plans to appoint their chairs rather than elect them (so committee is not adhering to governance properly).
 - v. Experiential learning: Draft of CUNY's Experiential Learning Report is being circulated and has no provision for experiential learning as a graduation requirement.



- vi. JW: statements about freedom of expression used to foreclose other people's rights to free speech. We need to be careful with rhetoric overall as these comments and lines of thinking often lead to problems.
- V. Steering Officer Reports
 - 1. Officer for Funding (Teddy Maghrak, but presented by JR)
 - i. Final Grants Committee meeting was April 4
 - ii. At CCB discretion, added 10% (\$1,975) to the grants budget to fund all events at least partially
 - iii. Approved 10 regular grant applications. 1 revision requested. Approved 1 start-up grant application. Funded 35 student-led events this year
 - iv. Budget: Beginning budget: \$19,750, increased budget (CCB discretion):
 \$21,725, funds awarded this round: \$6,615, funds awarded this year:
 \$21,251.81
 - 2. Officer for Governance & Membership (Kyla Bender-Baird, but presented by JPr)i. We have 77 seats and 75 reps in good standing
 - 3. Officer for Health & Wellness (Charlotte Thurston)
 - Nutrition workshop 3/25: PDF from workshop now online on H&W site under "Grad Student Wellness", tweets at #gcfoodforgrads, Sociology student creating OpenCUNY website with a tool that sends out recipes for cheap & nutrition meals.
 - ii. Wellness Festival 5/2: Free massages for students late morning-early afternoon, visit the DSC table for free swag + usual free items like safer sex materials and earplugs, other great events, resources, and info tables organized by Ashley Chastain!
 - iii. Interest in a workshop on Navigating Appeals, or have information to share on how to navigate the health insurance appeals process? Please let me know and send along info to me, will use for website as well as possible workshop. PS: state hotline for calling about health insurance problems.
 - iv. Mental Health Narratives: Committee created a Google form for submitting narratives, which can be found on the H&W website and here: <u>https://goo.gl/zMrZKU</u>. Please submit and encourage constituents to submit; we aim to reduce stigma and use narratives to advocate for better mental health care.
 - v. Upcoming: annual H&W survey: Please email about any questions/concerns you think the survey should include. Committee is looking into possible questions.
 - vi. Committee members JA and Nora Goldman are doing amazing work on all these issues, and are the labor force with me behind workshops, surveys, the DSC's role in the Wellness Festival: thanks!



- vii. Coffee hours: Alternating Wednesdays and Fridays. Next: Wednesday, 4/20
- viii. Crowdsourcing for H&W resources: Link on H&W Blog to Google doc: https://goo.gl/NDRWNi
- ix. Come by the office for safer sex materials, earplugs (and tampons, too we've got some free samples)
- x. Check to make sure NYSHIP status is up to date
- xi. Tax Day Tax Form 1095-C: Don't need to file, but check for accuracy and keep for your records!
- xii. Please refill safer sex bowls: materials in office (and more at Wellness Center). Contact me if you want to set up one for your program. Working to see if we can get more materials directly from the state
- xiii. New sections of H&W website. Apps/digital tools for health and wellness
- xiv. Cognitive Behavioral Therapy resources
- xv. Nutrition tips for Grad Students
- xvi. Working on putting handouts made w/ HS Hamad for Wellness Center workshops on website
- xvii. Upcoming: self-care, alternative providers, updated provider contact forms
- xviii. Strategic planning committee: Student Rep with Stephanie Vella. We stressed the need to make sure students have lower-workload funding, to expand the plan to deepen research culture by focusing on student research as labor, and to expand the section on to make sure the plan had clearly outlined goals for both student and faculty diversity. Also stressed the importance of tuition remission and the need to still focus energy on students past year 5.
- xix. MMu: what do you mean by focus on 'research as labor'?
 - 1. CT: research and datasets as being compensated for.
 - 2. SAJ: outside of science funding is tied to teaching, wants to see research we do in the humanities and social sciences as valid labor as well.
- 4. Officer for Outreach (Saiful Saleem)
 - i. Having an outreach event at Hunter in May right after spring break, movie and drinks. Email coming soon.
- 5. Officer for Student Life & Services (Carlos Camacho)
 - i. First meditation session was a success. Dates for following ones are: April 27th, May 11th and May 25th at 7PM in 5414.
 - ii. Essential Oils still available in the DSC Office
 - iii. Coffee Hours have been very popular and are excited to have more on the following dates: April 20th at 5:30PM
 - iv. Football/Soccer Signups Still Available: Now that Spring seems to have finally sprung we can plan meet-ups, more info soon
 - http://www.cunydsc.org



- v. Gym Discount: CRUNCH Fitness is offering us a discount: \$0 signup fee, Reduced prices for monthly membership
- vi. Committees: Serving on the Open CUNY Coordinator Search Committee
- 6. Officer for Technology & Library (Jeremy Randall)
 - IT Meeting was held on March 30. Listserv had a half-week long malfunction

 the situation is now fixed. Shibboleth is en-route for the library. Proofpoint
 is still glitchy. Looking into issues of fax services ending on Citrix
 - ii. Library Meeting: Chromebooks, soft-launch this summer w/ full implementation in the Fall. More money from the STF committee to help fund library purchases, including eBooks collections rather than single ones and ideally without DRM. Long-term goals of improving lending, and power sources for laptops. Alumni access to JSTOR, Sage, Versatile for this year's grads and onward
- VI. Announcements
 - 1. HS: Please help clean-up this space as you leave.
 - 2. SAJ: Navigating Future Spaces event; C-level 12:30/1PM Wednesday the 20th
- VII. Adjournment
 - 1. AM proposes to unanimously adjourn meeting, unless there are objections. No objections noted.

Meeting ends at 8:09pm.



Addendum - Vote on Constitution and Bylaw Changes April 15th 2016 Plenary

Constitution IV.1.1 Executive Committee

IV.1.1. Membership

The Executive Committee shall consist of the Co-Chair for Student Affairs, the Co-Chair for Communications, and the Co-Chair for Business, and two non-voting members being the USS Delegate, and the UFS Liaison.

Constitution III.3.4 University Student Senate Delegate

The duties of the University Student Senate (hereafter, "USS") Delegate shall include but not be limited to:

- a. representing the interests of the DSO at USS meetings;
- b. reporting to the DSC relevant activities of USS; and
- c. chairing the University Student Senate Advisory Committee.:
- <u>d. representing the interests of the DSO at Board of Trustees meetings; and</u>
- <u>Reporting to the DSC relevant activities of the Board of Trustees.</u>

Constitution III.3.5 University Faculty Liaison

The duties of the University Faculty Senate (hereafter, "UFS") Liaison shall include but not be limited to:

- a. attempting to express the interests of the DSO at UFS meetings and, if he or she is a UFS Senator, representing the interests of the DSO at UFS meetings insofar as they do not conflict with the interests of his or her constituency; and
- b. reporting to the DSC relevant activities of UFS.<u>; and</u>
- <u>c. representing the DSO and/or lobbying on its behalf at city and state government bodies.</u>

<u>Constitution III.3.9 Relationship of the University Student Senate Delegate and University Faculty Senate</u> <u>Liaison</u>

Both USS Delegate and UFS Liaison shall be primarily responsible for the position to which they have been elected; however, they may coordinate their externally-focused efforts on behalf of the DSO as needed.

Constitution Article VII. Referenda

<u>1.</u>It is the right of the members of the DSO to call a referendum vote on any issue or legislation that the members deem appropriate. An issue will be placed on the next regular DSO election ballot if a petition bearing the valid signatures of 5% of the membership of the DSO or 10% of the DSO if the referendum is on the Student Activity Fee, a simple majority of the Steering Committee, or a simple majority of the DSC representatives is submitted to the Executive Committee on or before <u>March 1 March 15</u>. If the petition states that an immediate vote is necessary, a special referendum ballot will be sent to all DSO members within 20 business days of receipt of any petition calling both for a referendum and for an immediate vote. Such a request for an immediate vote must be clearly specified in the required petition. Approval of a referendum will require a majority affirmative vote with not less than 10% of the members of the DSO voting within 20 business days.

<u>VII.2 A referendum proposing changes in the student activity fee shall be initiated by a petition of at least ten (10)</u> percent of the appropriate student body and voted upon in conjunction with student government elections.

a. <u>Where a referendum seeks to earmark student activity fees for a specific purpose or organization without</u> <u>changing the total student activity fee, the results of the referendum shall be sent to the college association for implementation.</u>



- b. Where a referendum seeks to earmark student activity fees for a specific purpose or organization by changing the total student activity fee, the results of such referendum shall be sent to the board by the president of the college together with his/her recommendation.
- c. <u>At the initiation of a petition of at least ten (10) percent of the appropriate student body, the college president</u> <u>may schedule a student referendum at a convenient time other than in conjunction with student government</u> <u>elections.</u>
- d. <u>Where the referendum seeks to affect the use or amount of student activity fees in the college purposes fund,</u> <u>the results of the referendum shall be sent to the board by the college president together with his/her</u> <u>recommendation.</u>

Constitution Article III.2.3 Nomination and Election of Representatives

DSO members shall be notified of their nomination within three <u>five</u> business days of the close of nominations and shall be presumed to accept nomination unless they decline nomination in writing.