

**Plenary
MINUTES
October 21st, 2016**

Plenary

Executive Committee

Present: Ahmed Ahmed, Khalid Al Hilli, Reethee Antony, Cassandra Barnes, Kyla Bender-Baird, Rachel Bogan, Allison Cabana, Carlos Camacho, Erin Cully, Maria del Rocio Carranza Brito, Kristofer Eckelhoff, Chloe Edmondson, Luke Elliott-Negri, Miranda Fedock, Rebecca Fullan, Ferzileta Gjika, Nick Glastonbury, Kerri-Leigh Heeseman, Jeannette Huaman, Emese Ilyes, Sean Kennedy, Raj Korpan, Amy Martin, Dadland Maye, Toby Moody, Marino Mugayar-Baldocchi, David Nagy, Jason Neilsen, Dominique Nisperos, Marcelo Nomura, Teresa Ober, Yasmin Ozer, Alison Parks, Irena Parvanova, Ana Perry, Jeremy Randall, Jacob Russell-Madonia, Warner Sabio, Cecilia Salvi, Liza Shapiro, Gwen Shaw, Hamad Sindhi, Iris Strangmann, Matthew Stuck, Charlotte Thurston, Alicen Weida, Janet Werther, Tellisia Williams, Alexander Wood

Steering Committee

Constitution and Bylaws

Absences: Carol Brathwaite, Rachel Chapman, Pablo Crespo, Andi Cupallari, Margit Edwards, Ernesto Garcia, Philip Johnson, Michael Murphy, Javier Otero Pena, Jennifer Prince, Robert Robinson, Sally Sharif, David Topel, Stephanie Vella, Nicole Whalen, Mikayla Zagoria-Moffet

Grants

Health & Wellness

Guest speaker: Marianna Azar (MA), Director of the Human Research Protection Program (HRPP)

Outreach

MA spoke about IRB procedures at the GC and at other campuses, the exempt review process, electronic submission of protocols, what the office pays attention to when reviewing protocols (consistency, clarity, coherence and compliance with procedures), and when protocols require full board review.

Student Services

Cecilia Salvi (CS) asked about timeline between submission of protocol and its approval.

USS Advisory Committee

MA: Amount of time depends on research and nature of submission (whether first time or revision). Time of initial pre-review is about 3 weeks from submission to return w/ feedback. Then five business days. When amendments are submitted entire protocols are reviewed.

Advocate Advisory Board

OpenCUNY Board

Nga Than (NT) asked about subjects abroad

MA: Minimal risk research projects need to be specified and will need justification to explain why written consent is not needed.

Governance Task Force

NT asked about quantitative projects.

EDLAB

MA: If data contains private identifiable information then you need consent; if data is genuinely publically available and doesn't meet definition of human subject research. If combination of data sets allows for identification of personal information then it is best to be cautious.

Student Tech Fee

Jeannette Huaman (JH) asked about human-specimens and what protocol is there for students whose departments are located off site from the GC.

MA: The campus of the faculty advisor is the campus where you should submit the IRB request. If specimens can't be identified, IRB review is not necessarily. De-identified human specimens don't require IRB review. Always submit when in doubt.

Dominique Nisperos (DN) asked about IRB waiver for educational practice.

MA: Any human subjects research will require IRB; program evaluation not subject to IRB review b/c its producing generalized knowledge; there is no blanket exemption; question of accreditation may arise.

CS asked what basic things students should know about the process.

MA: Lack of knowledge on role of faculty advisor. Faculty advisor should review the protocol prior to submission and this rarely happens. Faculty may not be aware how responsible they are if students are

out of compliance when it comes to research. The basic of research design and execution should be addressed by faculty. Second biggest problem is students' unrealistic approaches to deadlines. Submission of form should be first step in process rather than last. Advises students to plan ahead.

Tellisia Williams (TW) asked about how-to-guide for IDEATE.

MA: Guide was shared by CUNY Central, but may not be too useful. Office is creating its own IDEATE guide: "The Guide to the Perfect IDEATE Submission." Formal guide was separated into sections and separate section on website will have guidelines for how to work with system. IRB office is interested in making this process easier for everyone.

DN: Urges advocating with administration to push faculty mentors to aid students adequately.

CS calls the meeting to order at 5:23PM.

I. Approval of Agenda

CS moves to approve the agenda by unanimous consent. No objections noted. Agenda approved.

II. Approval of Minutes of Oct 21st, 2016

CS moves to approve minutes of Sep 16 2016 by unanimous consent. No objections noted. Minutes approved.

III. Executive Committee Reports

1. Co-Chair for Student Affairs (Cecilia Salvi | ccsa@cunydisc.org)

a) Chartered Organizations

- i. The meet and greet event for Chartered Org leaders on Sept 23 went well. I continue to solicit feedback and consult with chartered org leaders in person.
- ii. I've received one application from the Collective of Critical Transport Scholars. I've verified their signatures and constitution.
- iii. Status: 5 Chartered Orgs are active, and more than half have turned in their activity reports and budgets.
- iv. I have verified that after various attempts to have the former co-chair of CANES (an alum) vacate the office, he has not done so, and has not turned in his key to the Public Safety office. As a result, I will move the CANES office, pack up his belongings and possibly change the lock. CANES has elected a new co-chair and I will set up a meeting with him.

b) Room Reservations and Office Space

- i. I am working on a plan to reorganize some of the chartered org offices so that it is more efficient, and more space is available for the DSO to use.
- ii. I have reached out to 2 Comp Lit event organizers who host(ed) events in GC rooms and were charged. I will attempt to get reimbursements for both, as the DSC holds that students should not be charged for hosting multiple-day events in GC rooms.

c) Internal DSC

- i. In September, OGM and I worked on the elections for BioChemistry and Anthropology.
- ii. In October, OGM and I worked on the election for Middle Eastern Studies MA Program.
- iii. GTF will meet on 10/24.

d) Student Affairs

- i. CCB and CCC met with Student Affairs on 10/19 to discuss the proposed referendum. We verified that a petition and referendum must be held in the same semester, as the students who call for the referendum should be the same ones who vote on it (according to CUNY Central Legal). We also asked about the stat prog/incomplete policy, and VP Schoengood stated that students must coordinate with the professor and EO.

e) Structure Committee, Graduate Council

- i. Structure Committee met on 9/12 and 9/27 to review proposed governance documents for Computer Science and HLBLL. We ensured that the Computer Science document removed language that only “students in good academic standing” were members of the program and that students’ right to voice and vote on committees were clearly spelled out. HLBLL’s document was sent back because it does not follow the recommended format and was missing critical information.
- ii. We also reviewed the language on Presidential Search Committees. Instead of having only mainline faculty from 3 disciplines serve, 1 seat will be guaranteed for a GC-based faculty member, 1 seat for a college-based faculty member, and the last will be open (determined by who gets the most votes.)
- f) Executive Committee, Graduate Council
 - i. The Executive Committee of GC met on 10/11 to discuss the agenda for 10/26. The Computer Science governance document was approved. Changes to the Comp Lit bulletin were approved, with the understanding that students choose the 2 readers on their committee. Duncan Faherty then confirmed that it is the EO who appoints these readers, and USS rep Williams and I proposed a “friendly amendment”, to be presented at Grad Council and which has the support of Faherty and the Comp Lit EO, to add language indicating the students select the readers.
- g) Committee on Committees, Graduate Council
 - i. The Committee on Committees met on 10/18 to call for additional faculty and student members for committees.
- h) Board of Trustees, Fiscal Affairs Committee
 - i. Consideration of the FY2017-2018 Operating Budget Request
 - 1) This is a 1-year proposed budget, as well as a 4-year financial plan in line with the 4-year Master Plan that was recently presented to the BoT.
 - 2) VC Sapienza noted that CUNY has 3 sources of revenue- state, city and tuition, and that “tuition increases are critical” to supporting this plan & proposed budget. The request for rational tuition will be \$250 for the SC and \$100 for the CC, but CUNY will freeze CC tuition if it gets enough funding. They can’t commit to a SC tuition freeze.
 - 3) This money will be used to fund faculty salary increases (contractual). When asked, VC Sapienza stated that student tuition already goes to pay faculty salaries, and that’s how we’ve been able to grow the faculty by 1,000 new positions. Chair Onyejiukwa noted “We’ve heard that story before” and UFS Chair Conway noted that when rational tuition was implemented in 2011, the goal was to have 70% of courses taught by tenured faculty, and we haven’t “even come close” to that. Now, that goal is not in the new plan.
 - 4) CUNY will seek \$200.6 in additional investment- \$159.4 mil for SC and \$43.3 mil for CC. \$23.4 is currently coming from the City, and \$14.2 from the Administrative Efficiencies Action Plan. CUNY’s baseline needs will increase by \$55.8 million in FY 2017, and CUNY will continue to ask the State and City to fund these mandatory costs of operation. A 4-year request of predictable tuition is included.
 - 5) The plan is solid, and has the goal of growing programs that are beneficial to students: ASAP, Online Education especially for Adult Learners, Single Stop and CUNY Connects (CUNY students working as mentors in high schools). CUNY also hired a firm to find cost-cutting measures in CUNY Central (“business process redesign” and changes to services provided). However, it continues the worrisome trend of state disinvestment from public education, which then results in students having to foot the bill.
 - 6) A few of the questions Chika and I asked: Can we separate the tuition increases, which we oppose, from the rest of the budget? VC Sapienza said he would strongly recommend against that. What alternatives have been explored to increasing tuition? This year there was no tuition increase, what is the contingency plan if there is no increase in FY 2017? Both ii and iii were

answered by VC Sapienza, stating that CUNY doesn't have other resources to cover growing costs. How much money is going to hire and retain faculty of color? VC Sapienza answered that we don't have exact numbers. EVC Rabinowitz noted that of the 1/3 diverse faculty at CUNY, we've had a 1% increase in diversity. They also depend on older, generally white, faculty retiring and being replaced, and she mentioned plans to higher graduates from within CUNY's "diverse" doctoral programs.

ii. Other Considerations

- 1) I asked for statistics on the correlation between enrollment and race/ethnicity & gender. I was told those # are not yet available, but the committee will get them.
- 2) We're meeting again on 10/24 at noon at the request of Chair Schwartz to come to a consensus.
- 3) VC Sapienza sent the additional materials requested.

i) Questions:

- i. TW asks about availability of diversity numbers/stats for the Graduate Center. CS: I asked; have numbers available.
- ii. Rebecca Fullan (RF) asks for clarification on stat.prog reports. CS clarifies about satisfactory progress.
- iii. Ahmed Ahmed (AA) asks where tuition raise is coming from; state government or BoT? CS explains BoT's request. Request available in handout.

2. Co-Chair for Communications (Hamad Sindhi | ccc@cunydisc.org)

a) Executive Committee meetings

- i. Met with President Robinson (CR) on 10/11/16: CR informed us that the person hired as VP for Marketing and Communications left the GC, so they are going to start a new search; the DSC's EC brought up 3 main issues:
 - 1) Tuition remission:
 - Pushed about how this actually increases time to degree
 - University asked for \$600,000 charge back for tuition waivers last year
 - CR said that he needs to look at numbers of students who would need this and do more research
 - CR said there are 3 ways of doing this with siphoning money away from other areas: decrease number of students coming in; reduce size of funded students; needs to go through CUNY Central and seeing if the University is on board
 - Timeline: when data is available this can be done within this semester
 - 2) Diversity:
 - CR talked about ad-hoc committee on diversity, which has now become the permanent committee on diversity and inclusion, chaired by Martin Ruck; will ask for 2 student reps to join
 - CR started quoting numbers: 2004 - 80% white; now - 60% white (need to verify this) (Jennifer Corbin is IR person for this data)
 - CR talked about faculty recruitment: programs like to hire at the senior level not at the junior level, so putting burden on program culture; idea he has now is about getting CUNY college faculty to teach and be at the GC for 3-5 years (not same as Affiliate, but an entirely different arrangement)
 - CR mentioned increasing post-docs of color; need to verify data on this
 - CR talked about every program submitting a diversity plan; the Provost and Dean Owen have these plans; not yet on the Diversity website
 - We pushed him on program standing committees on diversity as a solution for changing cultures at the program level
 - 3) Accessibility:

- CR mentioned that an Office for Accessibility is in the new strategic plan, so there is a promise to have this materialized in the next 2-5 years
 - CR said that this is the priority for Student Affairs right now
- b) Questions:
- i. DN: Clarifies that there were student members on the ad-hoc committee on diversity but were never contacted again or reached out to new students; suggests that international students were counted in diversity number
 - ii. Janet Werther (JW): asks about how many students of color have full funding and the percentage breakdown of MA and PhD students
 - iii. DN: Post-docs were made by taking money away from IRADAC; so fewer students were funded to make more post-docs. That's bullshit.
 - iv. Kristofer Eckelhoff (KE) asks about transgender and gender non-conforming students to be considered; safety issues a concern.
3. Co-Chair for Business (Liza Shapiro | ccb@cunydsc.org)
- a) Regal and AMC available; ran out of Angelika this week and will reorder
 - b) Waiting for Central Admins to get back to us about using student funds for alcohol purchases
 - c) I'm taking on the gender-neutral bathroom fight: if interested in joining please e-mail
 - d) Please notify constituents of program allocation funds because students don't seem to know that they're separate from department.
4. USS Delegate (Tellisia Williams | uss@cunydsc.org)
- a) The 1st USS Plenary was held on Sunday, September 25th at Guttman Community College from 12:00 PM - 8:30 PM. At this meeting the USS received a briefing on policy items: The Freedom of Expression Policy, travel policy guidelines prohibiting alcohol consumption, and the Tuition Freeze Resolution.
 - i. Many of the delegates present at the meeting expressed concern around the Freedom of Expression Policy and the lack of transparency and communication regarding the drafts of this document.
 - ii. The interim chairperson apologized for this lapse in communication and explained that the USS is transitioning leadership and the email listservs need to be updated.
 - iii. The student reps felt that they need the most up to date information regarding these policies so they can report back to their campuses and also rally students to push back and speak at the Board of Trustees Public Hearings. It was suggested that the USS delegates' research dates online so they can be aware of these meetings. However, they were supposed to receive an email notification and a mailed copy.
 - iv. At this meeting two USF faculty reps were present and tried to argue that increased tuition was a necessary evil. USS delegates immediately pushed back and asked for stronger language; the USS unanimously passed the tuition freeze resolution.
 - v. The rest of the plenary was spent on the nomination of USS Officer positions. Candidates were nominated and then two speeches were given for each candidate: a two minute introduction speech followed by a five minute acceptance speech. Once all of the candidates were nominated and spoke we had a question and answer session. This was the longest meeting I ever attended. I stayed until the very end. I asked questions of each candidate.
 - b) Update on USS and the Freedom of Expression Policy:
 - i. The Interim Chairperson, Chika received word from the General Counsel's office that the Freedom of Expression policy is not coming to the BOT October meeting. It is not on the agenda.
 - c) Meeting with President Robinson on October 11th
 - i. The DSC executive committee met with President Chase to share our goals for the semester.
 - ii. Hot ticket items include the tuition remission, diversity, and the Office of Accessibility.
 - iii. I asked questions about support and structure for MALS students of color, "Diversity" and the need for full time faculty of color at the GC to support and mentor students.

- iv. President Robinson said that he was unaware about any disarray in MALS and that he would look into it personally; he also said that he would look into a new category to incentivize more faculty of color to come to the GC (not as affiliated faculty but a new category, buy them out of teaching time to be at the GC).
 - v. I plan to personally follow up on these inquiries because one of my goals for this semester is Diversity at the GC.
 - d) Meeting with Martin Ruck scheduled for Thursday, October 27th. He is the newly appointed Senior Advisor to the President for Diversity and Inclusion
 - e) The 2nd USS Plenary was held on October 16th at Baruch College from 12:00 PM – 5:30 PM. At this meeting we had officer reports and USS elections for new officer positions
 - i. USS partnership with the CUNY Rising Alliance – a platform for change aimed at meeting the needs of low income minority, immigrant and working-class students. Specific interests include 1. keeping CUNY accessible to low income, working class students; 2. provide every city high school graduate with a high quality CUNY education; 3. expanding supports that improve student's ability to transition successfully and maintain progress towards obtaining a degree; 4. increase equity within CUNY by narrowing the race-based differences in the time it takes to graduate; 5. address infrastructure needs and maintenance of building.
 - ii. Another resolution that was passed was the CUNY Student Bill of Rights which is in line with the CUNY Rising Alliance goals: Calls for free public higher education, quality instruction, support to aid retention and completion, safe and modern learning environments in good repair.
 - iii. Important item to note is that we pushed the need to have students voices heard at the Public Hearing of the BoT on October 19th to discuss the proposed tuition increases in the budget request. This is in direct opposition to the tuition freeze resolution that was passed unanimously by the USS on September 25th. I sent out blast emails to the DSC listserv and on FB urging students to sign up to speak, to be heard and counted.
 - iv. Next USS Plenary is scheduled for November 20th
5. UFS Liaison (Teresa Ober | ufs@cunydisc.org)
- a) During the last plenary meeting of the UFS on September 20th, Chancellor Milliken, Vice Chancellor Rabinowitz, and Vice Chancellor of Legal Affairs Shaeffer spoke. During the meeting, the new Master Plan for the University (2016-2020) was discussed, which has been approved as of the last BoT meeting.
 - b) The Policy on Freedom of Expression and Expressive conduct was also discussed and seemed to raise several concerns among faculty senators. During the meeting, it was mentioned that both issues would be raised during the upcoming BoT meeting. At this time, the Policy on Freedom of Expression has actually been removed from the agenda for the upcoming BoT meetings, but there is some speculation that it may return in the spring semester.
 - c) The next meeting of the University Faculty Senate will take place next Tuesday, October 25, 2016 at 6:30 P.M., in room 0818, 205 E. 42nd Street, New York, New York. The University Dean (Robert Ptachik) will be providing an update on enrollment. Also speaking will be the SUNY UFS Chair (Peter Knuepfer).
 - d) The next meeting of the Board of Trustees will take place next Wednesday, October 26, 2016 at 4:30 P.M., in room 14-220, Baruch College Vertical Campus, at 55 Lexington Avenue (corner of 24th Street), New York, New York. Among the items that are on the agenda are an amendment to the Governance Plan for the Graduate Center.

IV. Steering Officer Reports

1. Officer for Funding (Javier Otero-Peña | funding@cunydisc.org)
- a) Last Grants Committee meeting held on Tuesday, 4 October 2016. We reviewed 12 grant requests, for \$7,373.
 - b) 8 Grant proposals were approved for a total of \$4,599.
 - c) 4 proposals were asked to review and resubmit.

- d) No proposals were rejected.
 - e) Total amount left for future requests 2016-2017: \$12,951.
 - f) Next deadline for grant submissions is TONIGHT for the November 1 meeting. 3 proposals have been received so far, for \$1,900.
 - g) Two new Grants Committee members: Ana Perry from Art History and Emese Ilyes from Critical Social Psychology, for a total of 7 Grants Committee members. They will be incorporated for our next meeting, November 1, 2016.
2. Officer for Governance & Membership (Alison Parks | governance@cunydisc.org)
Tells all to stick around for voting items!
 3. Officer for Health & Wellness (Warner Sabio | health@cunydisc.org)
 - a) Nurse practitioner on leave until November 7th
 - b) Safer Sex Bowls! We have materials!
 4. Officer for Outreach (Janet Werther | outreach@cunydisc.org)
 - a) Still working to schedule a meeting. If you're interested in joining the committee or attending the (open) meeting, let me know! I'm meeting with the childcare center next Wednesday, so email me if you want me bring particular questions & concerns to the table. There is a new director for International Student Services, I will be meeting with her as well, so email me if there are things you want me to bring up to her. The upcoming event (TBD) will be great for that!
 - b) Do you want to reconstitute the Gender Neutral Bathrooms ad-hoc committee?? Email me about that, too!!
 5. Officer for Student Life & Services (Carlos Camacho | services@cunydisc.org)
 - a) Need volunteers to write brief profiles on free or cheap events in NYC so other folks can check them out. Pictures welcome.
 - b) Need volunteers also to share your gifts. Can you dance, have a talent that you can teach? Email me and we can plan an event to share those gifts with the larger student body.
 - c) Followup meeting with OpenCUNY is forthcoming.
 6. Officer for Technology & Library (Jeremy Randall | library@cunydisc.org)
 - a) Library has instituted group study with low-noise requests near the entrance
 - b) Library is aware of the limited hours but at this stage can't do much
 - c) U Drive is going away, instructions for on-campus GC computers has been circulated
 - d) CUNY FIRST is coming in May

V. New Business

1. DSC 2016-17 Budget changes presentation

Liza Shapiro (LS) presents the revised DSC 2016-17 budget, informing the body that they will be asked to approve this at the next Plenary meeting. Notes that the budget is now balanced.

2. Student Activity Fees Referendum

CS, LS and Hamad Sindhi (HS) present the petition to open a referendum on reallocating the student activity fees, and ask that the representatives help collect signatures from their programs. There is discussion about the motivation behind the petition, the timeline of the petition and referendum, methods by which students can sign the petition, and creation of an FAQ sheet to go along with the petition.

HS motions to amend agenda to include the resolution on tuition freeze resolution as NB item #4. TW seconds. There is discussion about whether there are enough reps in the room for quorum. Motion passes with one opposed.

3. New member ratification (voting item)

- a) Alison Parks (AP) reports on results of special elections and closed seats.

- b) AP moves to ratify Nicolas Glastonbury (Anthro) and Kerri-Leigh Heeseman (Audiology) to the body. Cassandra Barnes (CB) seconds. Motion passes unanimously.
- c) AP notes that now the body has 66 live seats with 66 active reps.

4. Tuition Freeze Resolution

HS moves to adopt the resolution. Sean Kennedy (SK) seconds. Motion passes unanimously.

5. Ad-hoc committee on Accessibility Services (voting item)

LS and HS describe work done by ad-hoc committee on accessibility services in the past.

Stefanie A. Jones (SAJ) moves to create ad-hoc committee on accessibility services. Reethee Antony (RA) seconds. Motion passes unanimously.

6. Constitution & Bylaws changes (voting items)

- a) Constitution Article III.2.1
AP motions to approve change of Article III.2.1. Jacob Russell Madonia (JRM) seconds. Motion passes unanimously.
- b) Constitution Article III.2.2
AP motions to approve change to Article III.2.2. KE seconds. Motion passes unanimously.
AP motions to add language to article III.2.2. Alexander Wood (AW) seconds. Motion passes unanimously.
- c) Bylaw 6.1.c
AP motions to approve changes to bylaw 6.1.c. Matt Stuck (MT) seconds. Motion passes unanimously.

7. Chartered Organization presentation

- a) Collective of Critical Transport Scholars
Hector Agredano (HA) presents on the chartered organization, and answers questions from representatives. CS reminds body that they will vote on chartering this organization at the next Plenary meeting.

VI. Announcements

- a) CS reminds reps to add their signatures on the petition.
- b) LS reminds reps to tape receipts to sheets.

VII. Adjournment

CS motions to adjourn; LS seconds; the motion passes unanimously. The meeting is adjourned at 7:20PM.

Minutes respectfully submitted by Liza Shapiro.