

The Doctoral and Graduate Students' Council The Graduate School and University Center The City University of New York 365 Fifth Avenue, Room 5495 New York, NY 10016-4309 T: 212.817.7888 E: dsc@cunydsc.org

W: http://cunydsc.org

Plenary **Minutes** December 14, 2018 4:30 PM

Attendance

Executive Committee

Plenary

Steering Committee

Constitution and Bylaws

Health & Wellness

Outreach

Grants

Student Services

USS Advisory Committee

Advocate Advisory Board

OpenCUNY Board

Governance Task Force

Present: Kutay Agardici (proxy: Tristen Goodwin), Kathryn Alessi, Andrew Alger, Nora Bartosik, Yuliya Barycheuskaya, Kyla Bender-Baird, Jelena Begonja, Ekaterina Bezborodko, Elena Chávez, Elizabeth Che, Carlos Cuestas (proxy: Maria Checa), Shawn Fagan, Shun Feng, Huber Jaramillo Gil, Damaly Gonzalez, Felix Grezes, Katia Henrys, Kelsey Hom, Roderick Hurley, Fadi Kafeety, Sean Kennedy, Mounira Keghida, Raj Korpan, Divya Matta (proxy: Lisa Millsaps), Mary Jean McNamara, David Monda, Jason Nielsen, Dominique Nisperos, Teresa Ober, Bernadette Ojukwu, Kieran O'Reilly, Yasmine Ouchikh, Alison Parks, Kajal Patel, Ana Perry, Lili Quiroa-Crowell (proxy: Joseph A. Torres-González), Saira Rafiee, Marlene Nava Ramos, Jules Salomone, Cecilia Salvi (proxy: William Novello), Sherry Sayavongsa, Dellamol Sebastian, Liza Shapiro, Francesca Silva, Anna Stenkamp, Armando Tapia, Charlotte Thurston (proxy: Fikreab Admasu), Steven Vallone, Tellisia Williams, Anaïs Wong, Zhuo Yin

Absent: Sara Akant, Shoumik Bhattacharya, Merrit Corrigan, Kristofer Eckelhoff, Marva Frederick, Sami Sauma, Janina Leonie Selzer, Isabel Dominguez Seoane, Gwen Shaw, Hamad Sindhi, Iris Strangmann, Mara Valderrama, Alicen Weida

Teresa Ober (Educational Psychology) Calls the meeting to order at 5:10 PM.

Approval of Agenda

Anna Perry (Art History): moves to approve the agenda with one emendation. New Business item #3 should read "Resolution Regarding Announcement of Amazon HQ in New York City" instead of "DSC Statement Opposing CUNY Endorsement of the Amazon HQ2 Expansion." It will remain a voting item.

William Novello (Political Science) seconds. There was no discussion. TO (Educational Psychology) Calls the motion to a vote. The motion passes unanimously.

Approval of Minutes of November 16, 2018

Dominique Nisperos (Sociology): Moves to approve the minutes.

Liza Shapiro (Comparative Literature): Seconds

Discussion:

Jason Nielsen (English): Makes a friendly emendation to add "Nora Bartosik" to those who were present at the November 2018 plenary.



DN (Sociology): Accepts the friendly emendation.

TO (Educational Psychology): Calls the motion to a vote. The motion passes unanimously.

Note on order: Votes for the passage of the agenda were recorded after the votes of the minutes approval.

III. Executive Committee Reports

1. Co-Chair for Student Affairs (Alison Parks)

Chartered Org Updates:

- Chartered Organizations: There are 20 which are now active. The deadline for the submission of reports and for collecting signatures is December 21. If you as a rep have not already signed rosters, please consider doing so that groups may access their funds.
- SPARC Title IX Training: December 21 is also the deadline for the SPARC online training. All DSC Representatives and Chartered Org Leaders must complete it. The OSA will be looking at the completion of SPARC Training in its verification of eligibility for students leaders when we submit our roster in the spring.

Amazon HQ2 Expansion

• The members of the DSC EC have expressed our outrage to the Chancellor that she and the Chairperson of the Board make statements on behalf of CUNY and its students about the anticipated relationship between the University and CUNY and we have a resolution to present to the floor tonight to put more weight behind it.

GC Presidential Search

• We also expressed directly to the interim chancellor that we hope she and the chairperson of the board our demand that they abide by the procedures for presidential searches set forth in the CUNY Manual of General Policy and not elect for an expedited, confidential search. Additionally, we have managed to get a resolution passed by Grad Council expressing the same sentiment so that way the students and the faculty on the search committee for our next president will be on the same page in urging the chancellor and the chairperson of the board to follow procedure and include the community in the process.

Room 5495

• The DSC Steering Committee has voted to begin a trial period in the Spring 2019 semester of leaving room 5495 open during the building's operating hours, similar to how program lounges are opened at the beginning of each day. We hope that this will contribute to students using the space to connect with one another. It will not be available for reservation by any one particular group.

Questions:

Ekaterina Bezborodko (Earth and Environmental Sciences): For people who have taken the SPARC training can we ask that they send confirmation emails.



Shawn Fagan (Psychology): It's processed on CUNYFirst so you can find whether yours has been processed there.

Kajal Patel (Psychology): If SPARC doesn't work, who should I contact?

TO (Educational Psychology): Please email CCSA or Elise Perram in the Office of Student Affairs.

Kathryn Alessi (MALS): I emailed Eric Brown when I had the same issue and he directly sent me instructions on how to bypass that issue so you should email him.

2. Co-Chair for Communications (Teresa Ober)

Recent Past Meetings

- Executive Committee of Graduate Council (November 27): During the Graduate Council agenda items were reviewed. A resolution regarding the hiring procedure for the GC Presidential Search was determined germane to the duties of Graduate Council and was given approval for being added to the agenda for the December 12 meeting.
- Meeting with Office of Student Affairs (December 7): During the meeting we discussed the
 issues concerning payment of international students, the WAC fellowship, NYSHIP, DSC's
 Participatory Budget initiative, among other topics. Very few students leaders have
 completed the SPARC training, which is mandatory.
- Phone call with Interim Chancellor Rabinowitz (December 12): Members of the DSC's Executive Committee had a phone meeting with the CUNY Interim Chancellor. We discussed a variety of topics, including the Chancellor's and Chairperson of the Board of Trustee's outspoken support of the announcement of Amazon HQ2. While Chancellor Rabinowitz acknowledged that she does not speak for everyone on the issue, we aimed to highlight the need for direct funding and advocacy for CUNY, as well as greater involvement of students in discussions around career development opportunities if direct partnerships with private industries are to be considered. We also discussed funding for CUNY students and infrastructure, including the enhanced MOE legislation. We briefly discussed funding inequities for doctoral and graduate students, including for students in the bench sciences, delayed payment for international students due to technical shortcomings of the CUNYFirst integration, and master's students. While still not on the record, the Chancellor suggested that low-cost health insurance may be available for all GC doctoral students beginning in fall 2019. More information is forthcoming.
- Graduate Council (December 12): During the meeting, which was chaired by the newly appointed Interim President, Joy Connolly, several curriculum changes were approved. The Master's in Data Analysis and Visualization will no longer required GRE scores to be submitted in the application for consideration. They can be submitted on an optional basis. There is some discussion of other programs, such as Biology also moving in a similar direction. More information is forthcoming. During the meeting, a resolution on maintaining an "open" hiring process of the Graduate Center President was adopted. The resolution calls for the Board of Trustees policy on Presidential Searches (Policy 2.12) to be maintained. This was a resolution brought forth by members of the DSC to ensure that the new college



president would not be decided without the input of GC community members. Text of the resolution is now posted on the DSC's site as well.

- Meeting with Dean of Assessment and Institutional Efficiency (December 14): Members of DSC Steering met with Dean of Assessment and Institutional Efficiency, Xiang. During the meeting we talked about Middle States, inquired about data, and learned about the data dashboards online: https://www.gc.cuny.edu/About-the-GC/Provost-s-Office/Institutional-Research-and-Effectiveness/Data-Dashboards.
- Meeting with Library Staff (December 14): DSC Co-Chairs and Officer for Library and Technology met with library staff, including Chief Library Polly Thistlethwaite. More on that to come in the report by Marlene, Officer for Library and Technology.

Upcoming Meetings

- December 18: College Association
- December 20: Meeting with Graduate Website Re-design team to discuss requests for proposals for website vendor

Announcements:

- DSC-L listsery: To share announcements about upcoming events, or just post a classified ad for an apartment or roommate, the DSC-L listsery is a great start. We currently have nearly 700 subscribers. If you would like to be added to the listsery, please email ccc@cunydsc.org. All subscribers can also actively post.
- For those who are looking to buy/sell or find a roommate/apartment, there is also a facebook group associated with the DSC's Facebook for that.
- If you are a representative, and you have not been receiving meeting material about a week in advance of the meetings, please email me at ccc@cunydsc.org.
- If you are interested in serving on a CUNY or Graduate Center-wide committee, please let me know. Particularly for Graduate Council Committees, we are starting to solicit nominations. Email ccc@cunydsc.org.
- Complete SPARC Training by December 21. You all should have received an email about it from Eric Brown, as well as from me (which also contained the meeting materials).

Questions:

Zhuo Yin (Physics): What's the Graduate Council Committee function? TO (Educational Psychology): They are just the standing committees for Graduate Council. Email me if you want further information about being on those committees.

3. Co-Chair for Business (Raj Korpan)

- PB: We got 4 proposals- accessible door for library, replacement and restocking of pantries, installation of wireless antenna on roof, and event to support artwork related to trans and gender-non-conforming communities. We will convene the committee and decide whether we need to hold a vote or whether we will just fund all four projects.
- DSC website transitioning off of GC server this month, purchasing process finally complete
- If you are one of two, or more, reps and still haven't yet submitted authorization memo for funds, please e-mail ccb@cunydsc.org, same for chartered org. leaders



- All reps should have received a tracking sheet for program allocation funds
- Legal consultations are available and intended for GC students only. Spread the word! email ccb@cunydsc.org
- Have Angelika, Regal and AMC discounted movie tickets available. Check cunydsc.org for office hours to buy tickets.
- Petrie Emergency Fund still available for students. Applications are on the financial aid website.
- Reminders regarding reimbursement requests: items that are purchased must be delivered directly to the Graduate Center, Honoraria must be paid directly to speakers

Questions:

DN (Sociology): Where is the website going?

RK (Computer Science): Right now we're hosted on the Graduate Center server. We were told by IT that they would no longer support us and gave us a year to transition. We are moving to an external server that is hosted by the company that we currently employ to maintain our website.

4. USS Delegate (Roderick Hurley)

USS Plenary - 11/18 - Guttman Community College

- Issues USS plans to address include Dream Act, MOE, TAP reform (including TAP for grad students), voter awareness/registration (No classes election day), expansion of opportunity programs, Title IX, food insecurity.
- Passed a resolution opposing tuition increases at CUNY 6th iteration of this resolution. Chapter 260 of the State Laws of 2011 established maintenance of effort provisions for SUNY and CUNY that required the State to provide general fund operating support, including fringe benefits, in an amount not less than the amount appropriated and made available in the prior State fiscal year unless the Executive declared a fiscal emergency. It authorized CUNY to increase tuition by up to \$300 each year, with the condition the this tuition money be used for student services. This law was in effect until July 1, 2016 when it briefly expired but was reinstated in the 2017-18 State Budget and is currently in effect until July 1, 2021. MOE bill has not been signed by the governor, so the required State funding is not being provided. In June, 2018 BOT voted to increase tuition by \$200. There is no report/evidence that this money is being used for student services.
- USS Elected members to its Ethics and Audit committees.
- Jennifer Hernandez from CCNY appointed as parliamentarian of the Plenary

USS Plenary - 12/09 - Guttman Community College

Representatives from CUNY Athletics addressed the Plenary. They briefed USS about the
work that CUNYAC does around the University and ways that students benefit. CUNYAC is
moving toward supporting more inclusive and adaptive sports, including a CUNY wheelchair
basketball team. The reps mentioned the <u>Students First Rewards</u> Program which awards
students who attend the most CUNYAC events with full tuition scholarships.



- Budget for FY2019 approved. One major change is the appointment of a part-time Communication Director at a cost of \$10,000.
- CUNY Black Male Initiative (BMI) requested to be recognized as a USS chartered CUNYwide organization. This request was denied as USS currently has no provisions or guidelines for chartering.
- USS meeting documents can be viewed here.

Board of Trustees Meeting

- BOT Chair Bill Thompson and Interim Chancellor Vita Rabinowitz issued <u>statements</u> about Amazon establishing its headquarters in NYC.
- USS Chairperson issued a <u>response</u>.
- Several students expressed disapproval of these statements (Hunter Grad Council issued a statement).
- Public Hearings held on December 3 and several students had their testimonies abruptly.
- USS Chairperson issued a <u>response</u>.
- All BOT meeting documents and video archives can be found here.

Events/Meetings

- 11/30 Represented DSC at CUNY Council of Student Government Presidents. I provided a brief outline of the issues we address: ongoing battles, current issues and priorities, achievements. Some issues highlighted at other campuses: Title IX, safety/facilities, student services
- 12/05 Represented USS at public hearing of the NYS Assembly Standing Committee on Higher Education in Albany. The committee is currently reviewing a legislative proposal to expand the maintenance of effort to include the SUNY Health Science Centers, all mandatory costs of SUNY and CUNY, including collective bargaining, salary increments, and other non-personal service costs such as utility costs, building rentals, and other inflationary expenses, and any increase in the tuition credit enacted by SUNY and CUNY.

Announcements

• 01/28 - BOT Public Hearing

Questions:

Huber Jaramillo Gil (LAILAC): Regarding the counseling services, if there's any additional hiring done they should not only increase the number of counselors they have, but also the diversity of their counselors. This is especially true given the diverse nature of the CUNY student population.

RK (Computer Science): Is there any plan by USS to address these gaps in Title IX and counseling services that exist CUNY-wide?



RH (Psychology): USS plans to address it at the central office rather than to go through the individual campuses.

Lisa Millsaps (Urban Education): In the meeting about the counseling centers, was there discussion of having some kind of alternative solution or discussion of increasing sessions beyond the 3 or 8.

RH (Psychology): No one was there to really answer these questions. Rather student leaders met to identify problems and workshop solutions. For this issue advocate for raising the issue with central office. Making sure to raise awareness of counselling and disability services to the central office.

5. UFS Liaison (Anaïs Wong)

- On Tuesday Nov 27 I talked to the UFS Executive Committee, to argue in favor of making the liaison to the DSC a full member of UFS. Faculty present were rather receptive and open to the idea, but also insisted that there were structural limits to what could be done in terms of membership to UFS. I will be working on the best strategy to make this possible.
- At the last UFS plenary last Tuesday (December 11), a lot of time was devoted to present suggested revisions to the UFS charter. Some of the proposed changes are intended to improve shared governance and make it easier for part-time faculty to serve, and encourage ineligible faculty to attend plenaries with voice but no vote, and other changes are meant to clarify the roles of UFS and bring the charter in compliance with the law. The charter will be under discussion for the next two UFS plenaries to allow for feedback form the body. Several faculty asked about whether UFS was subject to open meeting law, which seems to be the case but will be confirmed. The chair of the subcommittee on Academic Freedom briefly mentioned that his committee is working on a revised Freedom of Expression Policy that they hope to get vetted by USS. He commented that the DSC seemed to oppose any policy in the past, and suggested that now the DSC seems it might be ok with a policy "as long as there are provisions on hate speech." I'm not sure on what basis he made that guess.
- After an unproductive meeting with Title IX coordinator Edith Rivera at the end of October (which was organized after a memo was sent by the DSC EC to share student's concerns about the process of reporting harassment), it seems that the concerns discussed remain unaddressed. Several members of Steering have worked on designing a survey to try to assess the visibility, clarity, and effectiveness of Title IX resources. It will be distributed in early spring.

Questions:

Tellisia Williams (Psychology): Can you please provide more information about the freedom of expression of policy and the revised policy and the DSC support of the new revised policy?

AW (Political Science): They haven't released the draft of the revision. No document has been shared. They haven't released a timeline and I don't know where they got the bit about the DSC.

TO (Educational Psychology): The DSC has not made any statement in support of the revised policy and do not have a copy of it so not sure where that is coming from.



KB (EES): Is this Academic Freedom Policy the same one as the Freedom of Expression Act that the Board of Trustees tried to pass?

AW (Political Science): It would be a CUNY-wide Freedom of Expression Policy.

TO (Educational Psychology): It seems to be the same policy.

AW (Political Science): It does seem to be the same, but it is coming from the Academic Freedom Committee of the UFS.

RH (Psychology) USS position is that there is no benefit to students to creating barriers to student expression and organizing so voted against it

DN (Sociology): Does the DSC have a plan to recirculate its statement in opposition to the Freedom of Expression?

TO (Educational Psychology): Our course of action was to wait to draft a statement until the policy release but certainly is something that we can put together now to reiterate our stance in opposition to any policy that limits freedom of expression.

IV. Steering Officer Reports

1. Officer for Funding (Andrew Alger)

- The Grants Committee met on Friday, November 2nd to review seven proposals. Five were At its most recent meeting on December 4th, the Grants Committee reviewed five new proposals and one revised proposal. It approved the following:
 - a) \$700 for the Graduate Students in Music Conference
 - b) \$300 for the Political Science Department Conference
 - c) \$700 for the 22nd Annual CUNY Graduate Philosophy Conference: Intersubjectivity and Interpretation
 - d) \$800 for the Cumbia and Bullerengue Workshop
 - e) \$600 for the Lecture on Classics and Media Theory
- The total approved at the meeting was \$3,100.00 out of a requested \$3,998.00. So far this fiscal year, the committee has approved up to \$10,229.00. The remaining funds total \$9,771.00.
- The next application deadline will be January 18th at 11:59 PM EST. The next meeting of the Grants Committee should be determined by the incoming Officer for Funding at their earliest convenience.
- Several committee members have observed that proposals are being made without evidence that appropriate chartered organizations have been approached for financial support.

Questions:

TO (Educational Psychology): Thank you for your service.



RK (Computer Science): The tax exemption form is not just for grants, but for all purchases that you spend DSC money on.

KA (MALS): The MALS student association co-chairs ran into issues trying to use the form. Is there a script or something we can show managers in case we run into trouble like that?

RK (Computer Science): I can write something up to help. STAPLES is notorious for this - we haven't run into it with other vendors. All they need is the number. I'll talk to the business office to see if they can offer any support.

2. Officer for Governance & Membership (Alison Parks)

Membership:

- Seat for the Women's and Gender Studies MA Program is now open -- by petition.
- New members (voting item): Katia Henrys (Women's and Gender Studies MA Program) by petition and Sherry Sayavongsa (Audiology) by special election.
- I have reached out to students in six new MA Programs about the process of creating a seat and getting student representation on the DSC -- Data Science, Data Analysis and Visualization, Digital Humanities, International Migration Studies, Quantitative Methods in the Social Sciences, and Cognitive Neuroscience.

Governance:

• A Constitution and Bylaws meeting will be scheduled late January or first week in spring semester.

Questions:

None.

3. Officer for Health & Wellness (Ana Perry)

Finals Relief Stations:

• Finals Massages to take place Tuesday Dec. 18th from 10:00 AM-4:30 PM and Wednesday, December 19th from 12:00 PM-6:00 PM. They will be in the Library behind the elevators on a first come first serve basis.

Questions:

KA (MALS): How much would you recommend we tip?

AP (Art History): What you can! Usually a few dollars.

DM (Political Science): What is the schedule for the spring semester? Can we get the schedule earlier?

AP (Art History): We can't really get the dates soon than we do. They were announced at the last plenary, but I have to wait until the massage therapist knows her schedule and we arrange with the library.



AA (History): In that article that Joy mentioned about mental health for graduate student, a CUNY student was interviewed and mentioned that despite a lack of resources, generally, there are massages so thank you for your work. It is being seen and recognized!

4. Officer for Outreach (Shoumik Bhattacharya)

Nothing to report. Email <u>outreach@cunydsc.org</u> if you have any questions for the Officer for Outreach.

Questions: None.

5. Officer for Student Life & Services (Elena Chávez)

- The Student Life and Services Committee has been active this past semester. There were two self-defense workshops, there was a volunteer program in Hudson Park, there were several board game nights, and there was a civil resistance.
- If anyone wants to donate board games, please email services@cunydsc.org.
- There will be more events in the spring.

Questions: None.

6. Officer for Technology & Library (Marlene Nava Ramos)

- The GC Library is accepting applications for the Open Pedagogy Fellowship for the Spring 2019 semester, each carrying a \$2500 stipend. The Fellowship experience will enhance participants' understanding of open pedagogy and their ability to employ elements of open pedagogy in their teaching. Throughout the Fellowship, a variety of concepts relating to open pedagogy will be introduced, including but not limited to: evaluating, supplementing, and teaching with Open Educational Resources (OER), integrating zero-cost course materials, and licensing, copyright, and fair use as it pertains to OER.
- Student Technology Fee CFP: Please submit your proposals for tech initiatives by Friday, February 8th, 2019 in order to receive feedback from DSC officers and Ad-hoc Library Committee and share with the student body at February's DSC Plenary (on 02/15 at 4:30PM). Final proposals will be reviewed and voted in March 2019 by the Student Technology Fee (SFT) Committee, which is a multi-stakeholder group of students, faculty, and administrators. The STF Committee suggests tech initiatives and expenditures for the 2018-2019 budget to the University President, who then approves the budget.
- Update from IT Services, Elaine Montilla, Assistant Vice President: An IT Services Support technician will stationed inside the Library (2nd-floor study room) for the first two weeks of each semester (Fall & Spring) to answer questions related to email, IT Services, CUNYFirst, Blackboard, Printing, etc. They are also looking into enabling a chat service to allow students to communicate with the techs during business hours and will notify you when we are ready to launch. If students have any feedback in order to enhance IT Services'



communication with all students, then please contact David Kapur (mkapur@gc.cuny.edu), and cc Officer for Library and Technology (library@cunydsc.org).

- Library Visions on the *Advocate*: Please submit your library vision to be published in the *Advocate* as a direct quote. Your testimony can be published anonymously and should not be longer than a paragraph (~200 words) by Monday, December 17 at 6:00PM.
- DSC met with Library staff on December 14 and discussed a number of issues including
 ways to improve collaborative relationships both within GC officers (IT, Center for the
 Humanities, Digital Humanities, communications, etc.) as well as external parties such as
 NYPL, Columbia/ University. They also expressed desire to improve their physical space
 such as a new circulation desk, desks, and furniture for scanners and printers.

Ouestions:

Kelsey Hom (Biology): Where is the information about the fellowship?

MNR (EES): Various programs have released the information, and I've put it on the DSC's library services blog.

TO (Educational Psychology): I will also re-send it to the DSC Listserv.

ZY (Physics): What is NYPL?

MNR (EES): The New York Public Library. The state receives \$2 million from the state to the service the GC community and right now we're only getting the ILL service. We'd like to see increased service and improved relations.

Mounira Keghida (History): It says the open pedagogy fellowship if you have trouble uploading you can send it directly to Ms. Smith.

V. New Business

1. Ratification of New Members (Voting)

JN (English) moves to approve Katia Henrys (WGS) and Sherry Sayavongsa (Sociology)

AA (History) seconds.

There was no discussion. The motion passes unanimously.

2. Election of New At-Large Steering Officer (Voting)

AA (History) gives a description of the position of Steering Officer for Funding before nominations are solicited.

LM (Urban Education): What time are the additional meetings

TO (Educational Psychology): The Steering meetings are every first Friday and begin at 4:30 PM. They end when they end.



AA (History): The Grand Committee meetings dates and times are decided by the committee. The spring dates have not yet been decided.

TO (Educational Psychology): Opens the floor for nominations.

Elizabeth Che (Educational Psychology) nominates herself.

AA (History) seconds.

Seeing no other nominations, TO (Educational Psychology) closes the floor. There was no discussion.

Elizabeth Che (Educational Psychology) is unanimously elected as the new At-large Steering Officer.

3. Statement Opposing CUNY Endorsement of the Amazon HQ2 Expansion (Voting) AP (Political Science): Presents the statement. Copies of the statement are distributed. Moves to

the adopt the statement.

ACP (Art History): Seconds

Discussion:

EB (EES): Questions about some of the language, wondering if I were administration reading it and still really interested in promoting amazon do you think I could interpret this to say "we firmly believe the endorsement of students implore to withdraw endorsement...." does this open the door for the administration to say we have commitments and investments and the endorsement is no longer the same and see we responded to your concerns - those two parts seem to possibly suggest there are circumstances where the DSC would be open to that and want to clarify if that is their intention. Want to understand how these different parts of the statement work together?????

AP (Political Science): had actually hoped that the we firmly believe section be stricken from the statement - also don't want this passed with that in there. Stricken from the statement. AP makes amendation to revise the statement striking the sentence "we firmly believe..."

ZY (Physics): I was speaking with science students and professors about the HQ2 and they think that this is actually a pretty good opportunity for their students, although we don't know short term or long term effects. In the interest of the science students and professors this is a good thing.

RK (Computer Science): I support what Zhuo said. Other students and faculty in my program think that this is a good thing because it allows us to get into research.

Yuliya Barycheuskaya (History): I don't understand the premise of this.



TO (Educational Psychology): As point of information no that statement has not been made. The argument is that the focus should not be to fuel private industry but should be on centering public education.

RH (Psychology): There have been closed door conversations without student involvement. CUNY students have been offered as incentive but there has been no reciprocal incentive or response while they are also receiving benefits and resources from the state. We do not want to be used in any bargaining to lure Amazon to the city. I agree with Raj that the sentence should remain.

KA (MALS): They [the city/state] also promised amazon a helicopter pad, which is also going to cost money. Has there been any discussion of this by the drafters?

RH (Psychology): I'll add that the USS position has been that there is no student involvement in negotiations.

TO (Educational Psychology): the statement not in opposition to Amazon headquarters but highlighting the demands in the last paragraph that asks for more information and that CUNY students must have representation

MNR (EES): I think that striking out that sentence is not contradictory. Why not include language about what we are in favor of?

AP (Political Science) - We have already put a number of statements in our support of student issues like 7K, this is expressly about CUNY support of Amazon HQ.

AW (Political Science): We know that as Amazon comes here it is going to cost a lot and getting 3 billion dollars of tax breaks and state funding going toward Amazon and not toward higher education. The promise to bring jobs is so thin, it's so uncertain and unlikely that a lot of people at CUNY would benefit from these supposed jobs. I would be doubtful of an Amazon public statement or commitment in support of CUNY.

MK (History): Most important sentence lost in paragraph four. Make suggestion that the Chancellor does not speak for us be moved up to the last paragraph.

AP (Political Science): It originally was the last sentence. Moving it up might disturb the flow of the writing.

Saira Rafiee (Political Science): To the Science students, do you know how many jobs we are talking about?

Felix Grezes (Computer Science): I have heard the number 20,000 research positions.

SR (Political Science): I don't know, and I don't think anyone knows how many Computer Science from here will be hired by Amazon. What we do *know* is the cost and the impact,



structurally, by the move of Amazon Headquarters to New York. And that the cost is a lot. The point the statement is trying to make is that the Board of Trustees should not speak for students without consulting them.

YB (History): Because there is so much debate and controversy, perhaps it would be better to replace "question" versus "oppose."

AP (Political Science): I would not support any ammendations that watered down our opposition to this. This was drafted as part of our question of the larger goals of CUNY and its visions. We have historically been an activist institution for education for the masses, making us a pipeline for Amazon, a company that has shown no interest in human rights with poor labor practices goes against our values as an institution. The statement does not endorse an idea that if Amazon works with us we're interested. It is an opposition to the Chancellor making these statements. In the spirit of drafting it, that the only purpose of higher education is to create a workforce. As the person who made the statement I will not accept watered down language.

Lisa Millsteps (Urban Education): We could suggest that there be a town hall meeting. Perhaps calling out to say that there be a CUNY-wide Town Hall maybe that could bring to light these issues.

TO (Educational Psychology): There have been announced a series of 3 community meetings to discuss issues related to Amazon. The DSC has been in communications with the Chancellor and received a verbal promise to speak to students about Amazon specifically the USS. In regards to holding a Town Hall, when it comes to making specific demands it can be hard if it doesn't come through. Clarify if the call for communication meets the suggestion to ask for a Town Hall.

LM (Urban Education): I think that there should be more of the CUNY campuses coming together. We should try to put together something from all of the campus.

RH (Psychology): The DSC's statement serves a very specific purpose, but I'd also be willing to take a resolution to USS to have this passed by the university-wide student body

AA (History): Should the language about investment be changed.

AP (Political Science): This is the language that the governor's website states.

LS (Comparative Politics): I fully support this statement for several statements. First, Amazon as a corporation violates the political spirit of the DSC and the resolutions we've passed in the past. Second, I appreciate the parts about income and housing inequality. While some CUNY students may get jobs, Amazon coming into Long Island City will price out the same CUNY students and families from being able to afford housing in their neighborhoods.

SK (English): First, I'm glad that this has come to fore and started a discussion because it's been a long time since we've had a resolution. I want to say that I support the resolution as it stands. Calling out specific students including science students or computer science students is a divide and conquer tactic. There is a much larger question here.



Mary Jean McNamara (Classics): Is there

Anna (Psychology): I agree with what Andy was saying about the \$3.6 billion is vague.

AA (History): If you were to read this document without reading the footnoted document at the bottom of the first paragraph. You might not know what the 3.6 billion dollar investment refers to. Am I not correct that it is 3.6 billion tax breaks - is there a way of rephrasing that could more accurately reflect that rather than putting money in, it is forgoing the possible tax revenue while at the same time imposing austerity measures.

AP (Political Science): That is the language used on the NY State website.

LS (Comparative Literature): - I support this statement for numerous reasons. Some are that Amazon's practices go against resolutions the DSC has passed over the years, in terms of its labor practices, environmental practices. Important to me is the language of the income inequality on Long Island City and its neighboring areas where many students live. For those students who live there will continue to get priced out following the projects that move to Long Island City to provide housing for Amazon workers will not be affordable. CUNY has a mission to elevate middle class families, Amazon prices families out of Queens neighborhoods. This is why I will support this statement.

SK (English): I am glad that this resolution has spurred this much conversation. It is in line with the DSC's activist mission and want to thank the resolution writers. Want to speak briefly of whether to include the public commitment, at the end of the day it doesn't undermine the spirit of the resolution. My understanding is this is a broad statement of the needs of all students and faculty. I would like to strike that line, in general we should not be signaling out particular groups of students as this is something that will impact all CUNY students.

MN (Classics): The fourth paragraph down CUNY will be a pipeline, do not know how much that term is congruent with what we know of the Amazon expectations to hire. Makes amendation to write "pipeline, as stated by Chairperson"

AP (Political Science): That language is in response to the Chairperson from the Board of Trustees says he looks forward to CUNY being a pipeline to Amazon.

TO (Educational Psychology): Points that that amendation does not change the spirit of the statement and the name is mentioned earlier.

Ana (Psychology): Agree with Andrew about the 3.6 billion investment. It is a misleading term and for us to continue to use it perpetuates the misleading term.

TO (Educational Psychology): The end of the sentence does have a reference and a footnote.

MNR (EES): Propose to write 3.7 in corporate giveaways offered by New York State.



AP (Political Science): Accepts emendation.

RK (Computer Science): Clarify position that I am opposed to Amazon HQ moving to NY, because the first priority of the state should be investing in CUNY and not offering Corporate Giveaways. But it is happening so now we need to decide what we need to do. I disagree with CUNY being a pipeline to industry as my students are looking for practical skills that will give them a job. I do not like this idea that we are saying that CUNY is not a pipeline to industry.

MNR (EES): I propose amendation to stricken statement to fulfill the spirit of the statement "CUNY students and the working class neighborhoods or marginalized of NYC instead of faculty.

AP (Political Science): The public investment part violates the spirit with which the statement was written.

ZY (Physics): We mention the money given to Amazon that will not go to CUNY. Should change language and say the money should go to CUNY.

TO (Educational Psychology): We are already calling on legislation that directly investment in CUNY.

TO (Educational Psychology): We do not currently have quorum, we will not hold a vote this meeting. The motion will remain open on the table and will be reviewed during our next meeting as "Old Business."

VI. Announcements

1. DSC All Representatives Must Complete SPARC Training Before December 21, 2018 TO (Educational Psychology): Reminds all representatives that they must complete the SPARC Title IX Training or will be at-risk for being ineligible to serve.

2. Seeking Respondents for Survey on Graduate Teaching

EC (Psychology): Graduate student teaching association, if you are teaching a college level course we would like you to fill out the survey. There is chance to win a gift card to Amazon.

VII. Adjournment

Seeing no objections, TO (Educational Psychology) adjourns the meeting by unanimous consent at 7:23 PM.